Buddhist Triad Icon in Gandhara: Its Spread Eastward and Transformation

HIGASHIYAMA KENGO
Seijo University

It is well known that Buddhist sutras were brought into China by the people of Rou-zhi (月氏). In Yuanshou (元寿) 1 (2 B.C.), the envoy sent by the king of Rou-zhi dictated sutras at the court of Western Han. Thereafter Rou-zhi people, especially monks, played an important role in introducing Mahayana Buddhism into China.

The kingdom of Rou-zhi (月氏) was founded around 174 B.C. when Rou-zhi people were expelled by Huns (匈奴) from northeastern China and settled down in the region of Bactria. This Rou-zhi kingdom was destroyed by Kushans in the second half of the first century A.D. Despite that, Chinese continued to call the Kushan dynasty, which then ruled over Bactria and Gandhara, “the kingdom of Rou-zhi”. During this Kushan period, Buddhism spread widely with the special protection of King Kaniska. Buddhist art also flourished, especially in Gandhara region. Mahayana Buddhism, a new movement that believed in evangelistic activities, accelerated the expansion of Buddhism and its visual art into the Gandhara area of Central Asia and then to China.

On Kaniskan coins of the second century A.D. is a relief of a Buddhist image with the inscription “Sakyamuni”. From this fact it could be concluded that Buddhist images were created by the time of King Kaniska and that the introduction of these images into China took place soon after their creation. For example, in Chinese history books are accounts of erecting stupas, making Buddhist images and holding Buddhist ceremonies by the end of the second century A.D. To name some extant examples of that time: A second century ceramic pedestal with Buddhist image ornament (Plate 1) found in the tomb of the Eastern Han period in the Pengshan district of Sichuan Province (四川省彭山県). Appliques on an ancient Yueh celadon ware (古越磁) (Plate 2) and reliefs of divine deities and animals on a mirror with triangular edge (三角執鏡). This formation of Buddhist images in the reign of King Kaniska was a positive factor in accelerating the eastward expansion of Buddhism.

It is well known that the triad form, consisting of central figure and two attendants, was favored by Kushans in Gandhara. In China, after the fifth century A.D., many sculptures and paintings also were made in triad form. Although developments in Buddhist philosophy made its art more complex, the triad remained unchanged as the basic pattern for various Buddhist images. On walls of
the Dun Huang grottoes (敦煌石窟), many paintings are found depicting Buddha seated preaching under a tree with attendant bodhisattva on either side. It is also true that Buddha is not only painted with two bodhisattvas but with monks, devas and other bodhisattvas as well. In still other paintings, the triad is surrounded by treasure palace, ponds, grounds, trees and empty sky, all considered components of the Pure Land.

Surveying paintings of seated Buddhas preaching under a tree with two, four or six attendant figures in the Mogao grottoes (莫高窟), from the first half of the fifth century to the middle eighth century, one finds a surprising degree of similarity with low-relief triads in the Gandhara region, showing the same preaching Buddha. This resemblance testifies that Buddhist sculptures in China followed the model of Gandharan Buddhist art. The style of Chinese Buddhist images, however, was under strong influence from Gandharan sculpture only in the third and fourth centuries. Influence of Mathura style of central India became more prominent after the fifth century. The latter was transmitted through the Central Asian Silk Road to Hoxi-zoulang (河西走廊 Gansu Corridor) in China, strongly influencing Buddhist sculpture of the area, between Northern Wei and Northern Chou periods.

As mentioned before, the scene of seated Buddha preaching under a tree varies with time and—except for scenes of Pure Land with its complicated development after the seventh century—it is very difficult to say what each scene represents. Scenes of seated Buddha preaching under a tree exist even in very early caves of Dun Huang. At the center of the thousand Buddhas on the north and south walls of cave No. 272, painted in the first period of Northern dynasties, Buddha is depicted preaching under a tree with two bodhisattvas, four monks and four flying angels (Plate 3). In the second period, the same scene is painted larger on north and south walls under an inverted V-shaped ceiling in a cave with square columns. Such a scene is also depicted on north and south walls facing a square column. For example, on the north wall of cave No. 257, a standing Buddha is preaching with many bodhisattvas around him. In cave No. 251 (Plate 4) a seated Buddha flanked by two bodhisattvas and surrounded by four celebrating bodhisattvas can be seen on its north wall. The preaching scene on the south wall of cave No. 251 also takes the triad form but it is different in that the attendant to the right of Buddha is a monk and the one on his left is a deva.

In caves belonging to the second period of the Northern dynasties, paintings on north and south walls under inverted V-shaped ceilings are often associated with “Eight Major Episodes of Buddha’s Life”. For example, in caves No. 254 and 283, the scene of the first preaching of truth or Dharmachakra-pravartana and the scene of the defeat of Mara are depicted on the north and south walls, respectively, following what had become somewhat of a convention. However, in caves No. 251 and 435, scenes on north and south walls show the sermon under a tree with the central Buddha sitting on a round lotus throne, growing out of a treasure pond, with a bodhisattva standing on either side. A similar scene of seated Buddha
preaching under a tree on a treasure pond can be found at the center of the rear part of the north wall of cave No. 263 as well as at the center of the north and south walls of cave No. 249. In cave No. 283, Buddha is seated cross-legged on a lotus throne, flanked by a monk on the right side and a deva on the left (Plate 5). In cave No. 249, Buddha has four attendant bodhisattvas and they all stand on the throne, which grows directly out of the green treasure pond painted at the foot of the wall. Because the Buddha on the south wall (Plate 6) shows the dharmachakra mudra and the treasure pond, some scholars conjecture that the painting may be the prototype of Western Pure Land scenes.\(^6\)

Center of the south wall of cave No. 257 (Plate 7), the triad is placed in front of the gate-shaped palace and the central figure shows the dharmachakra mudra. There is no green pond but around the round lotus thrones on which they stand are unopened lotus leaves. And over the heads of two bodhisattvas are lotus buds and lotus flowers from which new souls are reborn. It may be assumed that this gate-shaped palace is an expression of some kind of heaven because, even in the early caves of Dun Huang, Tusita Heaven is expressed by symbolic palace architecture in which a bodhisattva is seated cross-legged.\(^7\) Yet I do not think that is enough to identify it with the Pure Land of the West. To name some contradictory examples, the oldest Amitabha sculpture in China with the inscription of “Wuliangshou-fo” (无量寿佛) does not have the dharmachakra mudra but has dhyana mudra.\(^8\) Attendants, Avalokitesvara and Mahasthamaprapta, do not have their usual attributes of diminutive Buddha and treasure bottle on their crowns. In cave No. 285, Western Wei period, is the oldest example of Amitabha’s Pure Land (Plate 8). It is identified by the inscription\(^9\) “Omituoqingt’u-bian” (阿弥陀净土变). The central Buddha is seated in preaching mudra but there is no treasure pond, nor such attributes as diminutive Buddha or treasure bottle on the crowns of four attendant bodhisattvas. On the north wall of the same cave, are seven sets of seated Buddha preaching under the tree. According to inscriptions on the fifth, sixth and seventh triads, counted from the east side, these seven scenes were originally intended to express “the Past Seven Buddhas”. But the first to fourth scenes have the inscription “Jing zao Wuliang-shou-fo” (敬造无量寿佛), meaning “humbly make this statue of Amitayus”. Probably this indicates that the intention of the donor changed before the wall paintings were finished.\(^10\) However, except for the seventh triad, which shows two seated Buddhas side by side, there is no iconographical difference among triads, whatsoever, even after the donor changed his mind.

As indicated earlier, the practice of not identifying figures through use of specific iconographic images continued into the early part of the seventh century. In Dun Huang, many scenes were depicted during the Sui dynasty in which the main Buddha and two or four attendants all sit on lotus thrones, and around these thrones there are lotus leaves and buds recreating the lotus pond without painting it in conventional green. Cave No. 244 has its four walls divided into three levels, creating space for 27 scenes of preaching Buddha—but it is impossible to identify most figures iconographically. There are some exceptions.
The preaching Buddha on the north side of the middle level of the east wall has two attendant devas. A pair of dragons are coiled around the right-hand deva and it is crowned by the heads of the dragons as well as by a treasure jewel. The left-hand deva has an elephant head. These attributes clearly symbolize that they are Naga and Deva among "the Highest Classes of Brave Beings". Therefore, the main figure is identified as Sakyamuni. The preaching Buddha on the east side of the middle level of the south wall sits with his left leg down. On the outer side of each attendant bodhisattva is a guardian king holding vajrayana in one hand and holding up one leg. They cannot be identified by name. These two examples are different from all the others, which are depicted with the main Buddha and two arhats and two bodhisattvas.

The lotus pond is an important component in the Pure Land scene, favored during Tang dynasty, but the presence of the pond does not mean that the scene painted is the Pure Land of Amitabha.

Looking back at the history of expression of such scenes, the second set of No. 11 wall painting of the north wall in cave No. 169 of Bingling-si shows the seated Buddha with dhyana mudra, escorted by two bodhisattvas (Plate 9). The main Buddha sits under the treasure canopy on a round upside-down lotus throne situated on a square treasure pond. The pond is colored green and a spiral pattern covers its surface. Bodhisattvas are identified by the cartouches as "Huayen-pusa" (華厳菩薩) and "Riguang-pusa" (日光菩薩), but the cartouche for the main figure is illegible. The third set, situated just below the second, depicts seated Buddha with preaching mudra and is identified from the cartouche as "Wuliangshou-fo". Buddha is not escorted by two bodhisattvas in this case, but by a seated Buddha with one leg crossed. On the left are two bodhisattvas and on the right is a bodhisattva wearing a gown, with only the upper body shown; another bodhisattva stands in the niche. From the inscriptions, they can be identified as Vimalakirti and his servants.

No. 12 wall painting is the triad showing Buddha preaching under a tree. Surrounding the lotus throne is a green round lotus pond, its surface covered with spirals. Just above the treasure tree are many seated Buddhas, some of whom are accompanied by ponds. Unfortunately the triad does not have a black ink cartouche, which would identify them iconographically.

Above wall No. 11 is No. 7 stucco figure of standing Buddha. From its appearance, this Buddha seems to be the main figure of "Trikala Buddhas". A boat-shaped mandala decorates the back of the Buddha. The halo consists of concentric circles painted in green and decorated with spirals to symbolize the pond. This symbolic pond of concentric green circles has 12 diminutive Buddhas seated on lotus thrones (Plate 10). All these scenes in the Bingling-si grottoes are works of the Western Qin period and can be classified as primitive examples of the formative period of such iconography. Yet scenes such as the story of Vimalakirti and the depiction of Amitayus are clearly expressions of the Mahayana world. Because all the above-mentioned are expressions connected in some way or other
Buddhist Triad Icon in Gandhara

with the treasure pond, they should be broadly interpreted as associating the presence of a pond with the Land of Buddha, as taught in Mahayana sutras, and not exclusively with the Pure Land of Amitabha.

Floor tiles of Northern Wei period were also decorated with subjects in connection with ponds. Binyangzhongdong of Longmen grottoes (龍門石窟寶陽中洞) had its floor decorated with lotus, flowing water pattern and incised pictures of water birds. In the Mogao grottoes of Dun Huang, the floor was decorated with tiles of lotus pattern. As these two examples testify, the floor of the cave symbolizes the treasure pond. Thus worshipers and donors in the cave were made to feel as though they were actually in Pure Land.

The significance of the pond, thus developed during the Northern dynasties period, remained unchanged under the Sui dynasty. In the story of Vimalakirti (Plate 11), which is spread on both right and left sides of the niche carved on the west wall of cave No. 420 of Mogao grottoes, the green lotus pond is painted in front of the palace of Vimalakirti and Manjusri bodhisattvas, and decorated with lotus leaves, flowers and various water birds. The same story depicted on both sides of the niche on the west wall of cave No. 278, dated to late Sui, shows lotus leaves near Manjusri to symbolize the existence of a pond. The universal emptiness that even makes it possible to change this Defiled Land to Pure Land, as taught in the Vimalakirti sutra, is here symbolized by depiction of a treasure pond.

The lotus pond continued to play an important role in scenes of Paradise during the Tang dynasty. The pond is depicted on various wall paintings in the Mogao grottoes, such as the story of Bhaisajya-guru-vaibhura-prabha on the north wall of cave No. 220, the story of Maitreya (Plate 12) on the north wall of cave No. 329 and the scene of Sakyamuni preaching on Vulture Peak (Plate 13) on the north side of the east wall of cave No. 332. Thus the lotus treasure pond is associated not only with Pure Land of Amitabha, but with the Land of Buddha in general.

Looking now at examples of sculptural triads in Gandharan art, 30-odd works still exist. Among them are four examples that show Buddha seated on a lotus throne, the stem of which rises from a lotus pond suggested by carved waves. The example in the National Museum at Karachi (Plate 14) depicts a pond in which fish and water birds swim, and reborn souls in the form of bodhisattvas are placed on small lotus flowers. Most of these examples, however, show the main Buddha seated with legs crossed on a lotus throne, while from each lotus grows a stem. The use of the stem clearly suggests a pond even without any actual representation of it. In any case, influence of Gandharan art, especially the triad form, was serious during the evolution of Chinese art of Mahayana Buddhism.

There are five extant examples of Gandharan art putting a triad under arch-shaped architecture and the remaining open space with Buddhas and bodhisattvas. Alfred Foucher has identified all five with the story of Sravasti and has further connected all the Gandharan triads with the same subject. On the other hand, Minamoto Toyomune argues that the triads are the depiction of Western Paradise. Higuchi Takayasu has also challenged Foucher, saying the main
Buddha of the triad was Sakyamuni in some cases and Amitabha in others.\textsuperscript{14} Recently, John Brough introduced the Gandharan triad with inscriptions connecting them with Amitabha and Avalokitesvara.\textsuperscript{15} The triad has lost the bodhisattva on the right side. The bodhisattva on the left is seated with right ankle crossed over his left thigh while his left leg is down. The right hand is touching his cheek, as though he is in meditation. There is nothing but the inscription to identify this Buddha as Amitabha. The question as to whether the triad of Amitabha could have been depicted is left to future researchers. Furthermore, it would be too much to assume that the triad is that of Amitabha just because the depiction of the treasure palace resembles that in Pure Land scenes of Chinese examples.

In China, depiction of Amitayus can be traced back to stucco triads of caves No. 8 and 189 in the Bingling-si grottoes. It is followed by an example in the Maowenqianzi autonomous district of Sinkiang Province (四川省茂汶羌族自治州), dated to 483 A.D. or Qiming (永明) 1 of Southern Ch'i. Others are in Guyangdong (古陽洞) of Lungmen grottoes, dated to Shengui (神亁) 2 or 519 A.D. and the wall painting of cave No. 285 of Mogao grottoes, dated to 538 or 539 A.D., or Datong (大統) 4 or 5. These examples are the same as the others except that they have no inscriptions to connect them with Amitabha. On the other hand, the wall painting in Maijishan grottoes (麦積山石窟), just above the niche on the right wall of cave No. 127, shows all six components of the Pure Land (Plate 15)—triad, treasure palace, pond, ground, tree and empty sky. The style of the triad and attendants puts this wall painting in the Western Wei period. In the Southern Xiangtangshan grottoes (南響堂山石窟) of Hebei Province (河北省) there is also depiction of the Pure Land in low relief, belonging to Northern Qi period.\textsuperscript{16} The stone relief at Wanfo-si site in Sinkiang Province is also an example of the same type belonging to the eighth century.\textsuperscript{17} Architectural style and human representation suggest that fully-developed depiction of Pure Land of Amitabha was perfected in China. Of these three examples, the one in Maijishan grottoes is most developed. Maijishan is located near ancient Chang an and one of the caves was made into the tomb\textsuperscript{18} of Empress Yifu (乙弗). The close relationship with the royal family helped spread the Pure Land trend in Chang an at an early stage. One of the oldest Pure Land scenes is that of the south wall of cave No. 220 in the Dun Huang grottoes. It dates to 842 A.D. or Zhenguang (貞觀) 6, but that of the Maijishan grottoes is even a century older.

Fifth century depiction of a palace to symbolize the Pure Land can be found in caves No. 275 and 254 at Dun Huang. On north and south walls and upper right and left sides of the center column in these caves are gate-shaped palace niches. Under the niches are bodhisattvas who are either meditating or seated with crossed legs in front of a throne. These palaces seem to suggest Tusita Heaven of Maitreya, judging from the Sui period example in cave No. 423 and others.\textsuperscript{19} On the upper level of palaces depicted in relief by Gandharan artists the bodhisattva was often either seated or meditating like those in Chinese caves, perhaps reflecting
Gandharan influence on Chinese art. Moreover, it is interesting to find similarities between examples found in caves No. 74 and 148 of the Maijishan grottoes and those in Lahore Museum. Maijishan triads show bodhisattva with legs crossed in front of the throne on the upper left side of a main wall and in meditation on the upper right side. The one in Lahore is very close to that style.

Although what each triad symbolizes is yet to be solved, a look through these examples makes it clear that Gandharan art influenced the early Mahayana Buddhist art of China. The palace shown in Tusita Heaven scene has the Han-style gate, but is surely an interpretation in China of the Gandharan palace. The expression of the palace came in as one of the symbols of Pure Land, along with a belief in Pure Land. And conventions of Pure Land scenes were formulated in temples in Chang an and transmitted to cave temples of Dun Huang in the seventh century.

There must have existed many routes for the spread of Buddhist-oriented culture along with Buddhist beliefs, and it must have been difficult to make pagans believe in it. But the Buddhist Kushans (or Darou-zhi in Chinese) took this on voluntarily. The fruitful result is obvious, but what made them do so and undergo such hardship and difficulty is still a mystery of history.

NOTES

1. For example, about 170 A.D. Lokaraksha (支婁迦譯) translated many Indian Mahayana sutras, such as "Banzhou sanmeijing" (般舟三昧經) and "Daoxing banruobolomijing" (道行般若波羅蜜經); Zhiliang (支亮) and Zhiqian (支謙) followed. They were all people of Rou-zhi. And so-called "Dun Huang-pusa" (敦煌菩薩) who most contributed in the spread of Buddhism, Zhufahu (竺法護) is also Rou-zhi.

2. The account of erection of a stupa by Shengrong (竺騰) is recorded both in "Taoqianchuan" (陶謙傳), vol. 83 of Houhanshu (後漢書) and "Liuyaochuan" (劉繇傳), vol. 49 of Sanguozhi (三國志).

3. The pedestal was found in the Eastern Han tomb in Pengshau district of Sinkiang Province in 1942. See Nanjing Bowuyuan (南京博物館) p. 77, vol. 4 of Chunguo Bowuguan Yeshu, Beijing, 1984.

4. Dun Huang Research Institute (敦煌研究院) classified caves No. 288, 272 and 275 as the first period, belonging to the Six Dynasties (or Sixteen Kingdoms of the Five Barbarian Tribes) period or Northern Liang period.

5. Examples of main Buddha with a bodhisattva and a deva on either side can be found. One is the No. 3 wall painting of cave No. 169 in Bingling-si grottoes. Another triad with deva as attendant is seen in a scene of the story of Buddha in Kizil grottoes.

6. Duan Wenjie (段文傑) stated that Buddha showed the dharmachakra mudra and looked very stern. Above the head of Buddha is a canopy decorated with a pair of dragons, and below his feet is a treasure pond full of lotus leaves and flowers. This particular painting is important because the intention of depicting the Western Paradise can be seen and this fact makes this a prototype of the later Pure Land scenes. See his "So-ki no Bakkokutsu Geijitu" in Tonko Bakkokutsu (『早期の薬高窟芸術』『敦煌薬高窟』), vol. 1, p. 187, Tokyo, 1980.

7. Toh Kengo (野健吾), "Tonko Bakkokutsu Dai 220-kutsu Shi-ron" in Bukkyo Geijutsu
8. No. 6 wall painting on the north wall of cave No. 169 in Balingli-si grottoes shows the main Buddha and two bodhisattvas in stucco. The central Buddha shows dhyana mudra and inscription “Wuliangshou-fo” (无量寿佛) in black ink on the upper edge of the halo. Bodhisattvas on both sides are also inscribed as “Dedashizhi-pusa” (得大勢至菩薩) and “Guanshiyin-pusa” (観世音菩薩). And the last line of a 24-line inscription on the east side of the wall dates it to Jianhong 1 (424 A.D.) of Western Ch‘in dynasty. The inscription is as follows: 「建弘元年歳在玄 三月十四造」.

9. This scene of Buddha preaching under the tree is painted on the north side of the east wall near the entrance of cave No. 285. The main Buddha is seated on a throne surrounded by a pair of bodhisattvas and a pair of arhats. The main figure is inscribed as “Wuliangshou-fo” and attendants are identified as “Wujinyi-pusa” (无尽意菩萨), “Wenshushili-pusa” (文殊师利菩萨), “Guanshiyin-pusa” (观世音菩萨) and “Da[shi(?)]zhi-pusa” (大至菩萨).

10. Among the seven sets of painting on the north wall of cave No. 285, the first is dated as Datong 5 (539 A.D.) by the inscription, fourth as Datong 5 and sixth as Datong 4 (538 A.D.).

11. Many floor tiles in Northern Wei caves in Mogao grottoes are Tang period replacements.


16. Currently it is kept in the Freer Gallery of Art in Washington, D. C. See also MIZUNO Seichi (水野清一) and NAGAIRO Toshio (長尾敬雄) Kyodozan Sekkutsu (響堂山石窟), Plate 18, Kyoto, 1937.

17. LIU Zhiyuan (劉志遠) and LIU Tingbi (劉廷璧), Chengdou Wansuo-si Shike-yishu (成都往佛寺刻芸術), p. 29, Beijing, 1957.

18. Lady Yifu was the empress to Wendi (文帝) of Western Wei dynasty. Beishi records that, to make peace with the tribe of Rouran (柔然), Emperor Wendi removed Lady Yifu from the statues of empresses and replaced her with the daughter of Rouran (小卓后). Lady Yifu was then ordered by imperial edict to commit suicide in the spring of Datong 8. She was buried in Maijishan and her tomb was called “Jiling” (寂陵). It is said the tomb is cave No. 43.

19. Toh, ibid.

PLATES

1. Ceramic pedestal with ornament of Buddhist Image found in Pengshan district of Sichuan Province (四川省彭山県), Eastern Han period.

2. Appliqués attached to ancient Yueh Celadon Ware (古越陶), Three Kingdoms period.

3. Triad in Dun Huang cave No. 272.
Buddhist Triad Icon in Gandhara

4. Scene of Buddha preaching, Dun Huang (敦煌) cave No. 251, Northern Wei period.
5. Scene of Buddha preaching, Dun Huang cave No. 283, Northern Wei period.
6. Scene of Buddha preaching, Dun Huang cave No. 249, Western Wei period.
7. Triad in Dun Huang cave No. 257, Northern Wei period.
8. Oldest example of Amitabha’s Pure Land, Dun Huang cave No. 285, Western Wei period.
9. Second set of No. 1 wall painting of north wall, cave No. 189, Bingling-si (炳靈寺石窟), Western Qin period.
10. Halo of the No. 7 stucco figure of the standing Buddha, Bingling-si, Western Qin period.
11. Story of Vimalakirti, Dun Huang cave No. 420, Sui period.
13. Scene of Sakyamuni preaching on Vulture Peak, Dun Huang cave No. 332, early Tang period.
15. Scene of the Pure Land with all six components, Maijishan (麦積山), cave No. 127, Western Wei period.
Pl. 2. Appliqués attached to ancient Yueh Celadon Ware (古越磁).

Pl. 3. Triad in Dun Huang (敦煌) cave No. 272.


Pl. 2. Appliqués attached to ancient Yueh Celadon Ware (古越磁).

Pl. 3. Triad in Dun Huang (敦煌) cave No. 272.


Pl. 5. Scene of Buddha preaching, Dun Huang cave No. 283.

Pl. 7. Triad in Dun Huang cave No. 257.

Pl. 6. Scene of Buddha preaching, Dun Huang cave No. 249.

Pl. 9. Second set of No. 11 wall painting of north wall, Bingling-si (炳靈寺石窟) cave No. 169.

Pl. 10. Halo of the No. 7 stucco figure of the standing Buddha, Bingling-si, cave No. 169.

Pl. 11. Story of Vimalakirti, Dun Huang cave No. 420.

Pl. 13. Scene of Sakyamuni preaching on Vulture Peak, Dun Huang cave No. 332.


Pl. 15. Scene of the Pure Land with all six components, Maijishan (麦積山) cave No. 127.